

Marshall City Council, Regular Session
Tuesday, September 4, 2012

CALL TO ORDER

IN REGULAR SESSION Tuesday, September 4, 2012 at 7:00 P.M. in the Commissioner's Chambers of the Calhoun County Building, 315 West Green Street, Marshall, MI, the Marshall City Council was called to order by Mayor Dyer.

ROLL CALL

Roll was called:

Present: Council Members: Booton, Mayor Dyer, Mankerian, Metzger, Miller, Reed and Williams.

Also Present: City Manager Tarkiewicz.

Absent: None.

INVOCATION/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Dennis Croy of the Marshall Wesleyan Church gave the invocation and Mayor Dyer led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Agenda was approved as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS

Bruce Smith spoke regarding the Hospital and Neighborhood Committee.

Steve Rhodes spoke regarding decision making and the responsibility as a decision making elected body.

Melanie Snodgrass feels we are giving up on our neighborhoods.

Patrice Marquardt spoke regarding how fragile our community is and how we need to preserve Marshall's character.

Ruth Shehigian asked that the issue be postponed and revisited at a later date.

Joyce Spicer read a prepared statement comparing Oaklawn to the former Trillium hospital in Albion.

Matt Lueck commented regarding the future of the health care industry.

Bob Mees feels the process needs to slow down and more professionals need to be brought in to analyze the situation.

Jennifer Rupp encouraged the Council to vote no and support the Planning

Marshall City Council, Regular Session
Tuesday, September 4, 2012

Commission's recommendations.

Rob Covert read a prepared statement regarding misinformation. (**Attachment A**)

James Hackworth feels the question is not what we can do, it's what we should do.

Tom Neidlinger feels the HCOD is a win/win situation and urged the Council to vote yes.

Ginger Williams read a prepared statement regarding the HNC process. (**Attachment B**).

Martin Overhiser believes the process was flawed and encouraged Council to vote no.

Bob Levy feels that us vs. them doesn't work and it's for the community to come together.

Tim McCaleb feels we are being bullied and stated that no single institution is bigger than Marshall itself.

Doug Jackson presented Council with a petition signed by over 90 property owners surrounding the HCOD district.

Faye Berry encouraged Council to get this issue solved.

Jerry Baremore feels that 20 years is too long of a time frame and the issue should be voted down.

Jim Codde expressed concern with the traffic and urged Council to vote no.

Dan Stulberg spoke supporting the hospital and believes that what is good for the hospital is good for the community.

Council recessed for a 15 minute break at 8:45 p.m. and resumed at 9:00 p.m.

Chuck Dobbins asked for clarification on who the zoning applicant is in this situation.

Brian Munger encouraged Council to carefully check the signatures on the petitions presented.

Casey Nager believes there is not a lot of division in the community and thanked

all of the volunteers who serve on the various committees of the City.

Ann Rhodes feels it is not practical to lock us into something for the next 20 years.

Chris Schute spoke regarding how this decision will be affecting someone.

CONSENT AGENDA

Moved Metzger, supported Reed:

- A. Adopt a resolution in support of the submittal to the Michigan Department of Transportation by the Broadway Grill LLC for a sidewalk café permit;
- B. Approve minutes of the City Council Regular Session and Work Session held on Monday, August 20, 2012;
- C. Approve city bills in the amount of \$178,525.68.

On a roll call vote – ayes: Booton, Mayor Dyer, Mankerian, Metzger, Miller, Reed, and Williams; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

PRESENTATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS

None.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS & SUBSEQUENT COUNCIL ACTION

None.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

REPORTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Hospital Campus Overlay District:

Moved Miller, supported Metzger to recuse Council Member Williams from deliberating on this issue. On a voice vote – **MOTION CARRIED.**

Moved Miller, supported Metzger, to approve the HCOD District as presented by the HNC.

Amendment 1:

Moved Metzger, supported Mankerian, to approve the Planning Commission recommendations concerning the text amendments, known as Option A. On a

roll call vote – ayes: Mankerian, Metzger, Miller, Reed, and Mayor Dyer; nays: Booton. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Amendment 2:

Moved Mankerian, supported Miller, to exclude, for the present, from the HNC overlay, those portions of the district that were not recommended for inclusion within the HCOD Overlay district by the Planning Commission. On a roll call vote – ayes: Metzger, Miller, Reed, Booton, Mayor Dyer, and Mankerian; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Moved Miller, supported Mankerian, to extend the meeting beyond 10:00 p.m. On a voice vote – **MOTION CARRIED.**

Amendment 3:

Moved Reed, supported Miller, to approve the boundary established by the HNC as an area specifically appropriate for future hospital expansion. On a roll call vote – ayes: Miller, Reed, Booton, Mayor Dyer, Mankerian, and Metzger; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Amendment 4:

Moved Miller, supported Mankerian, to remand to the Planning Commission, within their next two meetings, to seek their recommendation for a procedure to amend the HCOD to bring into the HCOD all or part of the property within the area approved for future hospital growth. Planning Commission is to specifically consider property ownership, demonstrated need for hospital expansion, the existence of a specific proposed project, and what detail should be supplied prior to consideration of that expansion. On a roll call vote – ayes: Reed, Booton, Mayor Dyer, Mankerian, Metzger, and Miller; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Amendment 5:

Moved Metzger, supported Mankerian, ~~to remand to the Planning Commission for reconsideration of the current proposed height restriction on Prospect Street, in light of the existing land elevation and potential land balancing. City Council recommends that the Planning Commission consider allowing a significant additional height for development to encourage growth in the area of Prospect Street. *and discourage the potential need for growth elsewhere within the area appropriate for future hospital growth.*~~ On a roll call vote – ayes: Booton, Mayor Dyer, Mankerian, Metzger, Miller, and Reed; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Amendment 6:

Moved Metzger, supported Reed, to remand to the Planning Commission for a recommendation, within their next two meetings, what HCOD uses should be permitted for those structures owned by Oaklawn Hospital within the area specifically appropriate for future hospital growth, but currently excluded from the HCOD. On a roll call vote – ayes: Mankerian, Metzger, Miller, Reed, Booton, and Mayor Dyer; nays: none. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Original Motion:

Moved Miller, supported Metzger, to approve the HCOD District as presented by the HNC with the amendments.

Moved Booton, supported Metzger, to table the previous motion to approve the HCOD District as presented by the HNC with the approved amendments. On a voice vote – **MOTION CARRIED.**

Moved Miller, supported Booton, to establish a permanent Oaklawn Land Use Committee.

Moved Reed, supported Mankerian, to table the previous motion to establish a permanent Oaklawn Land Use Committee. On a voice vote – **MOTION CARRIED.**

APPOINTMENTS / ELECTIONS

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None.

COUNCIL AND MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:56 p.m.

James L. Dyer, Mayor

Sandra Bird, Clerk-Treasurer